The perceptions of how critical thinking is embedded in Taiwanese nursing students' study

Li-Chiu Lin (PhD candidate),
Dr. Yung-Yu Su,
Dr. Patrick Crookes,
Dr. Kumiyo Inoue-Walsh
Outlines

- Motivation for performing this study
  - My personal learning experiences
  - My personal teaching experiences
- Literature review
- Aims of this study
- Research Methodology
- Results
- Discussion and Conclusion
- Limitation and Suggestion
Motivation for performing this study
Motivation for performing this study

- Critical thinking and its influence on teaching
  - Asian education
  - the issue of cultural differences between Asia and the West
    - to recognize the needs barriers to achieving change

- Rote learning
  - such educational methods are commonly used in Asian countries
    - including Taiwan
My personal learning experiences

- As a student in Taiwan
  - Primary school
  - High school (including nursing high school)
  - Nursing college

- As an international student in Australia
  - Bachelor
  - Master degree
  - A PhD student at the current stage
My personal teaching experiences

- As a lecturer in a nursing college
  - After Masters’ study of teaching (from 2000)
    - Tried to use critical thinking into my teaching –
      - Answer! Answer! Answer!!! We need your answer!
      - If we knew why, we don’t need to pay the money to sit here
  - During PhD study doing the teaching job – now / this study
    - Applying critical thinking into my teaching
      - What I found is presenting now
Literature review
The critical thinking was explained by American Philosophical Association in 1990 as

- a pervasive inquisitive, well-informed, stressful or reason, open-minded, flexible, fair-minded in evaluation, honest in facing personal biases, prudent in making judgements, willing to reconsider, clear about issued, orderly in complex matters, diligent in seeking relevant information, reasonable in the selection of criteria, focused in inquiry and persistent is seeking results which are as precise as the subject and the circumstances of inquiry permit...

(quoted in American Philosophical Association 1990 p 6)

Critical thinking in this study
- is connected with aspects including knowledge, arguments, analysis meaning, identifying problem
Literature reviews (II)

- **Teacher centred learning**
  - Asian students are normally used to teacher centred learning
  - Students memorise everything
    
    (Ballard & Clanchy 1991; Wong 2004)

- **Teachers’ traditional teaching styles**
  - Common traits of Asian students, including Taiwanese students, was ways of learning and their teachers’ traditional teaching styles.
    
    (Ballard & Clanchy 1991).
Aims of this study
to identify perceptions of instruction in critical thinking and its aspect of the development within Taiwanese students by way of the course of professional nursing ethics in a five-year college program

attempts to discuss the ideas of those who advocate its teaching and learning, concerning the roles of both teachers and students during the learning processes

discussing relevant issues to approaches students’ learning.
Research Methodology
Research framework

Plan (計畫)
Action (行動)
Observation (觀察)
Evaluation (反省)

Concept of action research
(Carr & Kemmis 1986)
The application of Action Research

An action research was applied

My position as an critical friend /moderator to help students to establish their critical thinking / cooperation skills
Sample selection and Data collection

- **Sample selection**
  - This study was cooperated with 200 third year students who were majored in nursing program at a five-year nursing college in Northern Taiwan.
  - Students who attend the course of professional nursing ethics were selected as study samples during September to January 2010.

- **Data collection**
  - using an opened questionnaire
  - contain analysis were applied with students’ consent to achieve the target of this study.
Basic introduction of nursing Ethics
- The principle of autonomy
- The principle of non-maleficence
- The principle of beneficence
- The principle of justice

The ethical consideration among patients and nurses

The ethical consideration among medical team

The principle of ethics in nursing profession
Topic contain

- Medical Malpractice Dispute
- Medication errors
- Sexual harassment
- Abortion
- Assisted Productive Technology/Surrogate mother/Unmarried pregnant
- Euthanasia
- Hospice
- Human experimentation
- Organ Transplant
Program activities

- Basic concept of ethic of nursing [lecturers]
- Topic presentation
- Movies/Films (ER...)/Videos
- Group discussion
- Subject debate
  - Abortion, Hospice, Organ Transplant
Progress of this study

- Lecturer
  - key point with power point combine with evidence discussion, and movies/video discussion

- Students presentation
  - Stage one
    - followed my style
    - key point with power point combine with evidence discussion
  - Stage two
    - movies / video discussion
  - Stage three
    - some groups started to interview people
Evaluation

- How students though about critical thinking operate into each topic
  - questionnaire combined with open ended

- Questionnaire’s answers contain
  - how much I could apply critical thinking into each topic
  - how much I learned from this topic
Results
Questionnaire contained

- With 184 of 200 (92.1%) students’ responses in this study
- Each question contains two section including
  1) level of harvest
  2) how much I can apply critical thinking in each topic
     - 批判性思考可以讓我以不同的角度去面對/思考所面對/解釋不同的問題 (I can think in different ways by using critical thinking)
     - Can I apply critical thinking into
       - Basic introduction of nursing Ethics
       - The ethical consideration among patients and nurses
       - The ethical consideration among medical team
       - The principle of ethics in nursing profession
       - Medical Malpractice Dispute
       - Medication errors
       - Sexual harassment
       - Abortion
       - Assisted Productive Technology/Surrogate mother/Unmarried pregnant
       - Alter record (病例竄改??)
       - Euthanasia
       - Telling patient diagnosis (告知診斷??)
       - Hospice
       - Issues of consent
       - Human experimentation
       - Organ Transplant
Students’ opinion of attending the course of professional nursing ethics by using critical thinking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Harvest/ Application</th>
<th>Strongly Disagreed</th>
<th>Disagreed</th>
<th>middle</th>
<th>Agreed</th>
<th>Strongly Agreed</th>
<th>Total (N)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>23.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>29.0</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>52.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>46.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>43.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>29.5</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>46.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>36.7</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>47.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>36.7</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>48.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>46.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>33.7</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>43.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>42.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>53.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>53.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>23.7</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>42.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>48.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q8</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>53.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>33.7</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>43.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q9</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>45.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>22.6</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>49.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q10</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>22.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>48.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>46.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>21.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>22.6</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>48.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>34.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>45.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>27.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>28.8</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>49.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>33.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>48.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>32.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16</td>
<td>Harvest</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>18.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Application</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>34.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Opened questions contained

Question 1: 你覺得這學期的上課方式與之前你的學習經驗有何不同？
What is your opinion about the differences between your learning experience in this semester and your prior experience?

Question 2: 你覺得最大的困難點在哪裡，為什麼？
What is your opinion about which is the most difficult part of your learning? Why?

Question 3: 對於這學期的課程內容你覺得哪一項比較可以協助你的批判性思考，請說出為什麼 (可多選)？
What is your opinion about which activity is useful for your learning? (multiple choice)
  ◆ 一般的授課內容 (lecturer)
  ◆ 影片欣賞 (movie, video)
  ◆ 案例分析討論 (case study)
  ◆ 主題辯論 (debate)
  ◆ 小組討論 (group discussion)

Question 4: 接上題你覺得哪一種方式最適合在課堂上使用來訓練你們的批判性思考？
What is your opinion about which activity can be used in your lecture?

Question 5: 如果你想訓練學生使用批判性思考，你覺得你會使用哪一種方式來教導學生？
If you were a teacher, which activity you would like to be used for teaching?
Question 1 - themes

- What is your opinion about the differences between your learning experience in this semester and your prior experience?
  - Differences in teaching and learning styles
    - Teacher was only a facilitator
    - Without textbook, no more memorise....
    - We had to find answer...
    - Two ways learning
    - We had to express our opinion
Question 2 - themes

- 你覺得最大的困難點在哪裡，為什麼？
- What is your opinion about which is the most difficult part of your learning? Why?
  - Thinking question by my own – teacher did not give direction
  - Where is answer!!!! We had to give other people answer
  - This question does not only have one answer
  - Struggle and challenge in speaking out
  - Learning of searching reference
Question 3 & 4 - themes

- 對於這學期的課程內容你覺得哪一項比較可以協助你的批判性思考，請說出為什麼 (可多選)？

- What is your opinion about which activity is useful for your learning? (multiple choice)
  - viewpoint, which activity can be used
    - 一般的授課內容 (lecturer) 4.3% (8)
    - 影片欣賞 (movie, video, film) 27% (50)
    - 案例分析討論 (case analysis) 52% (96)
    - 主題辯論 (debate) 49% (91)
    - 小組討論 (group discussion) 20% (38)
Question 5

如果你想訓練學生使用批判性思考，你覺得你會使用哪種方式來教導學生？

If you were a teacher, which activity you would like to be used for teaching?

- 一般的授課內容 (lecturer) 10% (20)
- 影片欣賞 (movie, video, film) 24% (45)
- 案例分析討論 (case analysis) 34% (64)
- 主題辯論 (debate) 49% (90)
- 小組討論 (group discussion) 18% (33)
- Examination 3 % (5)
- Answer question (no examine) 3 % (6)
- Don’t know/no answer 5% (10)
- Same as teacher teaching contain 20% (40)
Question 6

- What’s your harvest in this course?

- Increasing our

  - **Multiple thinking skills 61% (114)**
  - Problem solving skills 18 % (34)
  - Express our thinking 45 % (52)
  - Group discussion 9 % (16)
Discussion and Conclusion
Discussion

- students need direct instruction in critical thinking in the beginning of learning

- students’ learning style of rote learning in Taiwan
Conclusion

- The results of this study indicated
  - students need direct instruction in critical thinking in the beginning of learning
  - students’ learning style of rote learning in Taiwan.
- In order to ensure appropriate teaching styles
  - this study provided several useful recommendations for teachers and to assist their prospective students
Limitation and Suggestion
Limitation

- This study was performed at only one nursing college in Northern Taiwan.
  - It still need to demonstrate results of this study in different colleges/universities in Taiwan.
This study was a pilot study. It is a three years study. According to the result of this study, it suggests that

- **Case study** and **debate** could be regarded as the appropriate method for teaching the course of professional nursing ethics

- Students still need a direction to start the skills of critical thinking
Thank you for your listening.